



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: January 22, 2015

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 205
7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: Nancy Grissom, Acting Chairman Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member Jeff Templer, Member
See Attendance List Katy Hax Holmes, Staff

ABSENT: Len Sherman, Alternate
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with Nancy Grissom presiding as Acting Chairman. Voting permanent members were Armstrong, Dimond, Fitzmaurice, Fulkerson and Templer. No alternates were in attendance. Katy Hax Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device.

- 1000 Commonwealth Avenue – New ADA door**
Request to replace south side War Memorial doors

Daniel Bradford of KBA Architects presented the City’s plan to install an ADA compatible door on the Homer Street side of the War Memorial. He told the Commission that the photo he provided in the packet was the correct one, with a single door and a right-side sidelight. Text accompanying the image was, however, incorrect (two sidelights). The City’s Department of Public Buildings hired KBA Architects to install the ADA-compliant door leading to the War Memorial building. The scope of work was primarily to the interior of the building near the south-side entrance, with the exception of changing out the existing exterior door. The existing doorway has a five-foot wide opening with a pair of 2’6” wood leafs. The proposed door would replace these two doors with a single fiberglass 3’6” door with narrow sidelights on each side. Commission members had no comments.

Templer made a motion to approve the ADA door as proposed. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to approve the replacement of the existing War Memorial doors with an ADA compliant door as presented.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

2. **Newton Center T Station, NR – Demolition Review ****
Request to replace slate roof with metal standing seam

**** Review contingent upon timing of Massachusetts Historical Commission comment**

The owner of the building did not attend the hearing to present this item. The building owner hired LDA architects to prepare a proposal to replace the slate roof on the Newton Center T Station building with a metal standing seam roof. The owner asserted that he wanted to restore the slate material, but that the MBTA too narrowly restricted the time frame in which this work could be done. Because the roof was so close to live cables and the passenger area for the station, the MBTA had authority over when and how this work was completed. The owner stated that he proposed a metal roof because it was quicker to replace and better conformed to the MBTA's stated timeframe.

Because this building is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and was sold out of public use a few years ago, the sale carried with it a historical covenant on the building held in perpetuity by the Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC). As such the Massachusetts Historical Commission has veto authority over proposed changes to this historic building. The owner was not aware of this until we pointed it out to them, with confirmation provided by MHC. Two days before the hearing, the MHC submitted a formal review of the proposed roof slate replacement project and did not approve it as presented. There was no reason for the Newton Historical Commission to review this project once the MHC commented.

3. **1615 Beacon Street – Local Landmark report (MOVED TO APRIL)**
Review of study report for landmark designation

In response to a request by the owner, this item will be heard at the April 2015 regularly scheduled hearing.

In August of last year, the Ward 6 Aldermen submitted a formal request to the NHC to authorize a study report to establish this property as a historic Local Landmark. A month earlier, a demolition application was submitted by Sheldon Peck, owner, in time to be heard at the July 24th regularly scheduled hearing. The property was determined preferably preserved and an 18-month delay imposed at the July hearing. The first step in the landmark review process is to determine whether this property is individually listed on the National Register, or whether it would be eligible to be listed individually. Documentation was located which established that this property was included in an NR district; later, another set of documents confirmed that this property was also individually listed on the National Register. The property meets the first criteria. At the future hearing, Staff will present the landmarks report completed by Planning staff, which documents the property and attempts to make an argument for landmarking the property.

4. **28 Middlesex Road, NR – Antenna Installation**

Request to install tower on Longwood Clubhouse

Susan Arena, an architectural historian with EBI, and a representative from AT&T, presented their plan to install a cell tower inside a chimney that will be located on the south side of the Longwood Tennis Club House roof.

Staff reported that FCC laws allow for cell towers to be installed as of right, but applicants are required to work with local entities to obtain approval on installation plans. The chimney upon which AT&T planned to install its tower was not currently there, though the applicant asserted that a chimney of this height used to stand at this location. AT&T and

its affiliates were asked repeatedly to present evidence that a chimney of this height once stood at this location, but Planning received nothing thus far. The Planning Department received calls from Longwood members who were not pleased with this proposal.

Commission members were presented with historic photos of the chimney by the applicant and William O'Brien, which showed a former chimney at the proposed location. The applicants could not vouch for how tall the original chimney was, nor did they visually present evidence of how tall the replacement chimney would be. Without this information, Commission members were left visualizing how tall the proposed chimney might be. Commission members commented that the height and size of the proposed chimney did not appear to be in keeping with the historic chimney seen in photos, and believed that it would be adversely visible from a large portion of Chestnut Hill.

Dimond made a motion to deny the request for a cell tower chimney due to its proposed height and size. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0-1, with one recusal:

RESOLVED to deny the request for a cell tower chimney at 28 Middlesex Road due to its proposed height and size.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative</u>	<u>Abstained</u>
		Jean Fulkerson

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

5. **255 Cherry Street – Demolition Review**

Request to demolish all structures on property

No owner was present for this application.

Staff reported that though a house was standing at this location in 1895, the footprint of the 1895 house differs from the one on the 1907 map. This house was likely built c.1900. The owner in 1907 was Joanna Walsh, and in 1917 was Dan Walsh. The Walsh family owned the house until 1926. By 1929 the house had a detached garage under the ownership of E.H. McHugh. By 1935, a one story porch in the rear of the house was enclosed. In 1939, the front porch was removed and rebuilt. The McHugh family, who included Joseph and E.W., continued to own the house until at least 2014, when Joan McHugh Dee sold the house to Hung and Shuyen Liao. The McHugh family owned the house for over 70 years. This end-gable house with returns, 2/2 wooden sash windows, and articulated trim around the windows are all historic elements remaining on this farmhouse. Staff recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Commission members concurred with staff.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 255 Cherry Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 255 Cherry Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative:</u>	<u>Abstained:</u>
-----------------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templar, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

6. **131 Charlesbank Road – Partial Demolition Review, waiver of delay**

Request to demolish rear portion house

This property was presented as a full demo at the regularly scheduled hearing in August 2014 and was preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. The new owner, David Oliveri, returned to the Commission with a plan to keep two living units in the historic house and add two units to the back of the house and property. He is pursuing a special permit for this project. Mr. Oliveri told the Commission that the only demo would be to the back of the house and the two rear single-story bay windows. Garages would also be at the back of the property and not face front. There would space for eight cars to park. Sheathing on the house would be of wood clapboard and shingle where it was replaced, in the same pattern as existing. The proposed rear units would also be lower than the existing house in height. The new foundation would have a stone veneer. The owner said that he would replace windows with SDL 2/2 where warranted and was committed to keeping all of the stained glass windows where found. Gutters were aluminum now, and the owner said he would likely stay with aluminum.

Staff reported in August 2014 that there was a house on this lot in 1874 on property owned by Henry Lemon, but that this did not appear to be the same one. William H. Walker, the current house's first owner, was living on Charlesbank Road (then known as Nonantum Street) in 1868, most likely in the first house on this lot.

The footprint of the current house first appeared on insurance maps in 1886. Built c.1880, the estate of Nellie V. Walker owned the house in 1895 on what was still known as Nonantum Street. By 1901 the name of the road was changed to Charlesbank Road. In 1891, the house was owned by A. M. Ferris, a broker. By 1901, the owner was Charles J. Brown. In 1939, Earnest Chatfield, electrician, was the owner when a permit was issued to rebuild two chimneys above the roofline due to fire. Homes, Inc. owned the house from 1967 to at least 1970 for what appears to be rental units. In 1979 Richard Belkin owned the two-unit house. Tristram Lozaw was the owner of the house when there was another fire in 2001. This Queen Anne Style house was an intact, high-end example with distinct original architectural features, located in a neighborhood of Second Empire, Queen Anne, and Colonial Revival architecture.

Fulkerson made a motion to approve the waiver request with the condition that the full set of plans include materials on the plans, and that staff would have the authority to sign off on proposed materials. Fitzmaurice seconded he motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay for a partial demo of 131 Charlesbank Road based on approved plans, with the condition that the proposed materials appear on the final set of plans for staff approval.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templar, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Jean Fulkerson, Member

7. **307-309 Lexington Street, NR – Partial Demolition Review**

Request to demolish portion of side and rear

The owner of this house, Ivan Hernandez, presented it as a good example of Greek Revival architecture, and that he was preserving most of the building. Commission members concurred that it was a nice example of the style.

Staff reported that this house is listed on the National Register and built c.1860. This classic Greek Revival , end-gable colonnaded house stands on the west side of Lexington Street in a residential neighborhood comprised of late-19th century and early 20th century homes. As one of the earliest homes on the block, this house stands out for its high-style Greek Revival details, including its sidehall plan, deep overhang, and classical entablature above Doric columns. The earliest Newton directory lists James Dolliver as the owner in 1868. Later atlases show that he subdivided much of the land around this house, resulting in houses of later dates. Dolliver still lived here in 1875 and 1885, and by 1895, Harriet Dolliver was listed as owner. By 1907, John G. Forbes owned this house, the two lots behind it, and the next house up to the north on Lexington. He continued to own the house through 1917. Joseph C. Hannon Trust owned just this parcel by 1929, but Joseph lived at 38 Adella Avenue. Charles F. Perry lived here in 1938, and by 1942 the owner was Caleb Loring, but he too rented the house.

Caroline Sartwell was the owner as of 1946, when a garage was added to the rear of the lot. In 1951, Caroline added a sunporch/dining room to the southwest corner of the house near the driveway. 1964 was Herbert Hofstedt, a clerk. The owner in 1975 was George Prescott, deputy registrar of the Dept of Motor Vehicles. In 1993 the owner was Donald Carney. Though changes have been made to the house, such as the loss of an arched window in the front gable; loss of long windows on the north façade; removal of shiplap siding on the front façade beneath the overhang, and the replacement of windows, it still retains its setting, integrity of feeling, setting, style and materials. Staff recommends the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the NR-listed house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 307-309 Lexington Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context and to impose an 18-month demolition delay.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

Mr. Hernandez presented his plans to add on to the rear ell of the house, with a perpendicular gable roof for the addition. He said he hoped to add a two-story addition. Commission members commented that the new addition did not emulate the historic house in any way, and asked that the new addition incorporate some of the historic vocabulary of the existing house in the addition. Others commented that the proposed windows were completely different from the historic house, also not compatible, in that they were paired or tripled where the windows on the historic house were single sash. Commission members asked for better coordination in the design between the old and the new, and to subjugate the addition to the historic house in a more meaningful way.

Armstrong made a motion to deny a waiver of the delay for incompatibility with the historic structure. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to deny a waiver of the delay on 307-309 Lexington Street for incompatibility with the historic structure.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

8. **76 Paulson Road – Waiver Review**

Request to waive demo delay

David Silverstein presented his plans to replace this house with a new two-story, Tudor-esque home and waive the demo delay on this property. He explained that the lot was long and narrow, and they took into account neighbors' concerns about having too much height on the two sides of the house, so opted not to build a central entrance Colonial Style house he was originally planning. The owner is also proposing to push back the garage so as to avoid the 'snout house' phenomenon. New England fieldstone and real brick chimneys were also proposed.

At the regularly scheduled hearing on September 2014, David Silverstein and his attorney, Kenneth Krems, presented their plan to demolish this house. The applicant brought color graphics to show the styles of houses in the neighborhood surrounding this house, as well as houses that were demolished and replaced with new houses. Mr. Krems argued that this house did not meet the minimum standard for historical significance. The Commission determined the house preferably preserved for historic context. Mr. Silverstein is returning to the Commission with replacement plans for the house.

Staff reported at the September hearing that a 1936 building permit for the house was filed with Inspectional Services. Built by New England Homes Inc, and designed by Peter A. Caporale of Watertown, this Garrison Colonial house is an early example of this style, located in a neighborhood of houses built in the same period and in similar style. At the time of its construction, the house had an attached rear porch and side garage. In 1955, the owner was Harriet D. Nussenbaum when a rear porch was added behind the first. In 1990, the owner, Mark Durschlag, obtained a permit to build a rear kitchen and porch addition. There has been little new development in this neighborhood over time. As such, staff recommended this house preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

In September, a Commission member stated he believed an argument for historic context could be made for this house, and that he believed the Planning Dept thought so as well, even though the staff report cited architectural similarity rather than context. Staff agreed. The Chairman stated that he thought there was historic context and that the scale and style of this house was what the NHC was tasked with preserving in accordance with its ordinance.

At this hearing, Commission members commended the owner for addressing the context of the neighborhood in his design. Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road said that she thought the new house would be too close to the lot lines. A Commission member responded that with the use of eaves and stepped-back elements, the height was mitigated in the design.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the waiver based on submitted designs, with the condition that materials be added to the plans and reviewed by staff before a building permit is issued. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to approve the waiver of the delay at 76 Paulson Road based on submitted designs and the condition that materials be written on the plans and approved by staff.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

9. **61 Esty Farm Road – Waiver Request**

Request to waive demo delay

The architect for the owner appeared on behalf of the owner who was not present. This house was preferably preserved in July 2014 hearing, when the prospective buyer presented her plan to demolish the house. The new owner was returning with plans to add on to the house rather than demolish it.

At the July hearing, Staff reported that the building permit for the construction of this split-level house in 1959 is the only permit application in the ISD folder. Sunny Lane Homes, a construction company working in partnership with R.I. Williams, architect, was responsible for the design and construction of all the houses on this street. The Esty Farm Road-June Lane area is considered to be one of the largest collections of Contemporary-style, split-level houses in Newton. In 1961, Abraham Spigel, lawyer, was listed as the owner of the house and it stayed in the family until 2013.

Staff reported that the house at 61 Esty Farm Road was a fine example of this period of architecture and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context as part of a planned community.

The abutters in attendance, Maxine Marcus, 72 Esty Farm and one other, gave a brief history of the area. They said the houses were built on what used to be the Esty Farm and that there was some fill on the lots. They were also concerned about drainage from a new structure on the lot, since flooding was already common. Commission members discussed the fact that this was an intact planned development and that the homes were very well designed and constructed.

At this hearing, Commission members asked about the addition and details about its size and materials. The architect initially told the Commission the main portion of the house would remain the same, but then listed all of the materials and features that would be altered. Commission members explained the meaning behind the word preservation and discussion ensued as to what would be acceptable replacements that preserved the architectural integrity of the house. The architect was told he needed to supply a materials list for the addition and the house before a building permit could be issued. Commission members concurred that the size of the lot was conducive to an addition of these proportions.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the addition and to commend the owner on the preservation of like materials on the addition and the house. Approval is based on the condition that materials be included on the plans and submitted to staff for a building permit could be issued. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to approve the waiver of the delay at 61 Esty Farm Road based on submitted designs on the condition that materials be written on the plans and approved by staff.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

10. **1099 Walnut Street – Waiver Request**

Request to waive demo delay

Simon and Jane Chan returned to the hearing with the extra elevation and revised materials plan that were requested at the December 2014 hearing. At the December 2014 hearing, Simon and Jane Chan, who live in Quincy, told the Commission they bought this house three months ago because they liked the house and its location. They said parking was an issue on the street, so they wanted to construct a rear addition that held a garage. The house was preferably preserved at the December hearing and plans were reviewed for the rear addition. Plans were not approved due to missing information about one façade, and proposed materials.

In December, staff reported that originally owned by Winthrop, and later Frances Scandlin, a bookkeeper and Boston commuter in the mid-1880s, this house was constructed between 1886-1888 presumably as a spec house, along with an identical house next door at 1093 Walnut Street. Built in the Shingle Style, this house is located in a neighborhood of similarly detailed Victorian homes with little large-scale alteration evident. Major tenets of the style, such as projecting oversized gable, side entrance, curved reveals and a corner turret, are all intact. By 1918 to at least 1932, the owner was Joel Hathaway, chief inspector for public schools. In 1918, he obtained a permit to 'put a large door in front of stable.' In 1945, Anthony Marken obtained a permit to remove windows from the living and dining rooms and cover the openings. By 1956, he obtained a permit to flatten the garage roof to better install an overhead door. He still owned the house in 1966.

In December, Commission members said they thought the addition concept was good, but they needed to see all sides of the addition, particularly the right side elevation, and all materials labeled on the plans. The owners were also told the please keep wooden shingles on the second floor level and clapboard on the first story to match existing. They were also asked to retain the 12/2 windows, and to preserve as many historic windows as possible. The Commission also asked for a 3-D rendering of the proposed addition to better represent the proposed massing. Mr. Chan provided this information.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the waiver on the delay at 1099 Walnut Street based on the complete submission of plans and requested revisions. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to approve the waiver of the delay at 1099 Walnut Street based on submitted designs and the condition that materials be written on the plans and approved by staff.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Jean Fulkerson, Member

11. **11 Ruane Road – Waiver Request**

Request to waive demo delay

Peter Sachs represented the owner and presented the proposed replacement plans for this house. At the regularly scheduled hearing in September 2014, Mr. Wooding, the owner, presented that this house had water, mold and flooding problems and that it had to come down. He also said that this house was not as well maintained as others in the neighborhood and that it had been rented for a long time. The Commission voted to find the house preferably preserved for historic context. The architect returned with replacement plans for the house.

In September, staff reported that this brick, split-level home was built in 1951 by Leo B. Margolian and first owned by Joseph Rosenshine, a lawyer. He and his wife still lived there until at least 1985. A rear addition was constructed in 1972. A rear addition for a home business was permitted in 1995 when the house was owned by Sandra Vanlegun. A rear porch addition was also rebuilt as enclosed housing space, and an insurance claim for damage to the home was filed in 2010 under her ownership as well. This house is similar in design, orientation, materials and massing to others of this design in the immediate neighborhood, and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for historic context.

In September, Commission members said that they thought the neighborhood was contextually intact in general, and that the existing ranches were one-story and well designed. Another member said she thought the other ranch houses had respectfully maintained their homes and that the same could be done here. The owner told the Commission could not review replacement plans at this hearing, distributed an image of a French Chateausque replacement structure and asked the Commission if it was deemed to be an approvable replacement. The Commission told him the image he provided did not appear to be in keeping with the rest of the neighborhood, but in four months' time he could return with a completed application and it would be reviewed.

Mr. Sachs presented three letters of support from neighbors in support of the replacement project. Mr. Sachs said the house would use the new lot setbacks, which were greater than old house setbacks. He said the foundation for the house would be raised about 18" above the water table because the water table was essentially at ground level. Drainage was a huge issue and Mr. Sachs said this house and the required drainage plan for onsite work would address it. Commission members were concerned about this design's limited attempt at conforming to the current neighborhood context. Mr. Sachs stated there was no way to build a ranch style or horizontal – featured house in this neighborhood given its water and drainage issues. He also stated that if all ranches in the neighborhood were simply just raised a story, then it would be a neighborhood of boxes. He thought his design was more interesting. An abutter at 5025 Comm. Ave. spoke in favor of the project.

Templer made a motion to waive the demo delay on this house. Fulkerson seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-1-1, with one recusal:

RESOLVED to approve the waiver of the delay at 11 Ruane Road based on submitted designs and the condition that materials be written on the plans and approved by staff.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Member

Jean Fulkerson, Member

12. **8-10 Keefe Road/22-24 River Street – Waiver Review**

Ward Shifman and his architect presented their plans to restore the house at 22-24 River Street and add an addition; and remove the two buildings on Keefe Road and replace them with two attached dwellings. Commission members were told this was a by-right project.

At the June 2014 hearing, Lawrence Lee, attorney for Ward Shifman, presented Shipman's plans to demolish the two buildings on the River Street parcel, and both buildings on the Keefe Street parcel. Commission members discussed how the scale of the neighborhood was in keeping with these buildings and that the builder was encouraged to preserve them. One of the buildings is a modular home and staff told the Commission this building was exempt from their review. Ward Shifman is returning to the Commission with revised plans to save the historic home on River Street and add onto the rear, and remove both buildings on Keefe Street.

Keefe Road: Staff reported that there were two connected buildings on this lot. The northernmost building was a modular home from Kane Construction installed in 1998, which did not qualify as historic under the Demo Delay Ordinance. The red Cape Style house connected to the modular building on the south side was constructed c.1962 and was converted to a two-family house the same year. The first owner of the house was Richard DeMichele, who bought the house as designed by Donald Leonard of Craftwood Builders. The houses to the south of these two on the street were predominantly older, from c.1910 to the 1920s. This Cape Style house was a later example of this style in Newton, and as such was not a rare example. Many of the houses on this street were older and largely intact, which made this Cape house a later intrusion rather than a contextual addition to the neighborhood. Staff recommended that the house be found not preferably preserved. Commission members disagreed, and found the Cape house to be in keeping with the context of the neighborhood.

River Street: At the June hearing, Staff reported that the house was located on the south side of Elliot Street next door to 8-10 Keefe Avenue. This property was comprised of a multi-family house built c.1840 according to the Assessors database, and a shed. The shed did not appear to be historic. A building permit for what was a 1923 garage on the property listed the date of the house as 1873, a date which was more in keeping with the architectural style of the house. This house was one of the oldest on the street and possibly the neighborhood. In 1875 this house stood to the south and across the street from the Newton Cotton Mills buildings on Elliot Street, and was owned by Ed. Kanane. This was also the only house on what later became River Avenue and Chandler Place, before the latter was renamed Keefe Avenue in around 1900. In 1895, Ed. Kannane continued to own this house. Mary Kannane owned the house in 1907. In 1917 the house and lot were owned by Giulio DeMichele, likely the same family who purchased the lot at 10 Keefe Avenue to the west in 1962. Given the date and location of this house in one of the oldest manufacturing neighborhoods in Newton, staff recommended this house be preferably preserved for architectural significance and for historic context.

Commission members were pleased that the historic home at 22-24 River Street would be preserved as part of this project, and that both buildings captured the scale of the neighborhood.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to waive the demo delay on the houses at 22-24 River Street and 8-10 Keefe Road provided that all materials and window types are included on the construction plans for approval by staff. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on the houses at 22-24 River Street and 8-10 Keefe Road provided that all materials and window types are included on the construction plans for approval by staff, and that the house at 22-24 River Street be preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

13. **27 Faxon Street - Waiver Review**
Request to waive demo delay

Bill Dillon, an owner of the property, told the Commission he spent a reasonable amount of time trying to save the house but decided he could not save it and build two code complaint units. He told the Commission there were large variations of houses on the street, both new and old, and that they were very close to the street.

In August 2014, Bill Dillon, Joe White, and John Wardwell presented their plan to demolish the house and replace it with code compliant housing. They said that to preserve the house was not cost effective and that the structural elements of the house were under-sized. At the August hearing, the house was preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. The developers are returning with a proposed replacement house.

At the August hearing, Staff reported that the house was built in the late 1880s. Martha Kybert was the first owner of this property in 1886. Thomas Kybert operated a shoemaking business on the premises and was still there as of 1907. From 1925 to at least 1946, George E. Terrio, chauffer, owned the house and in 1938 obtained a permit to build a two-car metal garage. In 1947 the owner was A. Recine, who moved the garage from the right to the left rear of the lot. Directories also confirm the house held many tenants over the years. Though the house is sheathed in asbestos siding and has some deferred maintenance, the massing, architectural details of vergeboards and brackets on the front porch and standard front-gable form found everywhere in Nonantum are tenets of the architectural development of this neighborhood. Staff recommended this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

In August, an abutter at 20-22 Faxon Street, Dan Doucette, expressed his concern that the area was densely populated with children and did not want to see more crowded housing units.

At this hearing, Commission members asked whether any attempt had been made to put the garages in back. They were told that yes this was considered but the lot was too narrow. Members wanted the applicant to push the garages back and bring forward the covered entrances more, as this street had many porches near the street that encouraged walking and socializing with neighbors. Others wanted to see a design that was asymmetrical to add interest to the design. An abutter at 22 Faxon noted that there was a handicap sidewalk access in front of the house and thought it should be kept. Others said the house was too far back and should be in line with other buildings.

Armstrong made a motion to deny the waiver based on issues with the building's symmetry, prominence of garage doors, setback location, curb cuts and that materials should be listed on plans which conform to those recommended in the design guidelines. Fulkerson seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to deny the waiver based on issues with the building's symmetry, prominence of garage doors, setback location, curb cuts and that materials should be listed on plans which conform to those recommended in the design guidelines.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

14. **258 Cherry Street – Waiver Review**
Request to waive demo delay

Nick Nickalazzo and his architect Scott Lewis returned to the Commission with revised plans for a rear addition. This addition would be added to the back and connect the house with a detached garage on site. At the July 2014 hearing, they presented plans to add a rear addition to the house that had a flat roof. The owners lived there 21 years and wanted to add space for an aging relative. The house was preferably preserved for architectural integrity and a one-year delay imposed. Plans for an addition to the house were not approved that night.

At the July hearing, staff reported that this Mansard roofed cottage with dormers and window hoods was constructed c.1873. The agenda lists this project as a full demo proposal, but this application actually came in as a partial demo delay. This house was proposed as a full demo in April 2011 and was found preferably preserved at the May 26, 2011 meeting.

The portion of the house to be removed is the rear. The roof and massing of the original house will purportedly remain the same. This cottage-sized interpretation of the Second Empire Style is rare in Newton, as is one that is as well preserved. The bracketed front entrance and window hoods appear to be original design elements. Atlases and city directories show that Phineas Allen, a teacher at Nathaniel Allen's English and Classical School on Webster Street (now a Local Landmark), may have been the first owner of this cottage. Directories show him living there no earlier than 1875, and he lived there for at least ten years. By 1895 the owner was John J. Gannon, mason. By 1915 the owner was Richard E. Meyers, a forester, who continued to live there until at least 1945. By the 1960s, the owners were Paul and June Oulette. Nick and Lydia Nicolazzo are the current owners.

Commission members commented that this was a vastly improved design over the last one. Design of the existing garage would remain the same, including the existing vinyl door. Mr. Lewis told the Commission that the materials would match those found on the main house.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to waive the demo delay with the proviso that materials be added to the plans and approved by staff before a building permit could be issued. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay at 258 Cherry Street with the proviso that materials be added to the plans and approved by staff before a building permit could be issued.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

15. **44 Olde Field Road – Demolition Review**

Request to demolish house and attached garage

The new owner of this house presented his case for demolishing it and replacing it with a new one. He said it was in substandard condition and that the neighborhood was in transition. The owner described the deteriorated state of the house and its additions and that a previous owner's decision to turn the garage into a dining room was weird. The owner said he lived there 11 years with his family.

Staff reported that this house was built in 1936 with a two-car garage. The owner/builder was Edward Scott. The owner in 1940 was Charles H. Linehan, an insurance broker, and he owned the house until at least 1948. By 1958 the owner was Harold Swiman, whose family owned the house until 1991. In those years, Harold Swiman turned the garage into a dining room and built a single story rear addition. He also installed a pool in 1978, which was later removed in 2005. Though the additions that are visible from a public way are interesting, to say the least, the core 1936 house, built of brick in a Modern traditional style, appears to be intact and is in keeping with the historic context of the 1930s post-Depression era neighborhood. Staff recommends the house preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members commented that the brick central house with the slate roof was a historic component in good condition, but that they agreed the additions were problematic. The owner said the slate was falling off the roof. Commission members discussed the fact that this appeared to be an intact neighborhood and that in these cases, these neighborhoods are viewed as assets to the City. Other members thought the neighborhood represented a nice mix of styles from the same period. An abutter from 50 Olde Field Road said he had no opinion on this house but wanted to know what was proposed.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 44 Olde Field Road preferably preserved for historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 44 Olde Field Road preferably preserved for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

16. **91 Albert Road – Demolition Review**

Request to waive demo delay

Tim Burke and Garrett Higgins, architect and owner respectively, presented their plan to demolish this house and build a house with better southern exposure (the current garage was on the south side) and that met the needs of their large family. The family wanted to stay in the Burr school district but wanted something other than a Ranch house that would meet their needs.

Staff reported that this house Ranch style house was built in 1952 by owner/builder Joseph Arduino. By 1955 a one-car garage was attached under the ownership of Nils and Virginia Beckstrom. Nils is listed as a gauge maker, and later as working in machines. In 1971 the house was owned by the Fitch family. The ranch house appears to have undergone few alterations over time and is located in a 1950s neighborhood of like-style housing. There has been some redevelopment in the neighborhood, though most of the housing remains in its original ranch form. Staff recommends the house preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members discussed the fact that this neighborhood was too far into transition and could find no reason to find this house preferably preserved.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house at 91 Albert Road not preferably preserved. Templar seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 91 Albert Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templar, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

17. **91 Walker Street – Waiver Review**
Request to waive demo delay

Kevin Randall returned to the Commission with revisions that were requested by the Commission at the December 2014 hearing. At the December 2014 hearing, Kevin Randall, owner of this house, told the Commission he had maintained the house appropriately over time and just wanted to add a rear addition. Commission members reviewed the house for its architectural integrity and discussed its context, and found the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

In December, Staff reported that early owner W.B Lincoln, pulled a plumbing permit in 1910. In 1918, he pulled a permit for a 'Piggen House' and a garage. I can't speak to the piggen house (reportedly a house for a single pig), but this is quite early for a garage. In 1929 the owner was listed as Horace Hayden (no occupation). In 1944 the owner was Loring Hayden, who in 1946 added a window on the back of the house. In 1957 the house was owned by John Moscato of Lorraine Cleaners. As with the house located at 1099 Walnut Street (which you will hear next), this house retains all the tenets of the Colonial Revival Style including hipped bay windows, corbeled eaves, framed, asymmetrical pediments, sloped second story overhang, and the massing and scale of this style in a neighborhood of similar styled buildings. Staff therefore recommends this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

In December, Commission members inquired as to the design and placement of the new addition, as well as the garage plan. Mr. Randall said that all setbacks, FAR, exterior details and moldings would be in keeping with the house and zoning. A new unit would be added. Windows were depicted on plans as casements, and Commission members expressed their preference for double-hung sashes. The Chairman pointed out that there were construction drawings presented, but not enough elevations to make a reasonable decision about this property. The Commission also needed to see materials proposed for the addition to show whether architectural continuity would be maintained between the old house and the addition. Mr. Randall agreed to return with more elevations and a materials list. No waiver was granted.

Mr. Randall changed the casements to double-hung sash on the plans, and presented elevations for the three sides of the proposed addition. Two changes were made to the plans as approved: two awning windows were deleted from one of the facades, and a casement window was added at the kitchen wall. Materials were also requested as listed on the plans themselves for staff review prior to Mr. Randall obtaining a building permit.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay at 91 Walker Street based on the removal of two awning windows, the addition of a casement in the kitchen, and staff approval of a materials list that is included on the construction drawings. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on January 22, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay at 91 Walker Street based on the removal of two awning windows, the addition of a casement in the kitchen, and staff approval of a materials list that is included on the construction drawings.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

18. **Administrative Discussion:**

- a) The December minutes were approved by a majority of the members present.
- b) Nancy Grissom was unanimously elected interim Chairman of the Newton Historical Commission, with a regularly scheduled annual election scheduled for July 2015.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:55 pm.

Katy Hax Holmes
Commission Staff